BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 10631465 1

MUNICIPAL AND PLANNING LAW

S. M. Makuch

Volume 1

1985 - 1986

With the assistance of

Mary Bull

Faculty of Law

University of Toronto

LAW LIBRARY

SEP 5 1985

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

FACULTY OF LAW LIBRARY
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

MUNICIPAL AND PLANNING LAW

S. M. Makuch

Volume 1

1985 - 1986

With the assistance of

Mary Bull

Faculty of Law

University of Toronto

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/municipalplannin01maku_8

MUNICIPAL AND PLANNING LAW

Table of Contents

CHAPTER I

Introduction 1

Jarvis, Acting for a Developer 2

Michaelman, Politics and Values 5

Robarts, Report of the Royal Commission on Metropolitan Toronto 6

Dupre, Intergovernmental Finance in Ontario: A Provincial-Local Perspective 11

Plunkett, The Financial Structure and the Decision-Making Process of Canadian Municipal Government 16

Notes and Questions 21

CHAPTER II

THE ORGANIZATION OF MUNICIPALITIES

Introduction 22

A. Approaches to Municipal Organization 23

Plunkett, Urban Canada and Its Government 23

Note 29

Frug, City as Legal Concept 29

1. Municipal Council 30

Royal Commission on Metropolitan Toronto UPDATE 30

2. The Executive 31

(i) The Mayor 31

Jaffary & Makuch, Local Decision-Making and Administration 31

(ii) Reforming the Mayoralty 32

Jaffary and Makuch, Local Decision-Making and Administration 32

3. The Board of Control - Executive Committee 34

(i) Description 34

Plunkett, Urban Canada and Its Government 34

Notes 36

Jaffary & Makuch, Local Decision-Making and Administration 37

(ii) Reform 37

Rowat, The Canadian Municipal System 39

4. The Manager Plan 41

Rowat, The Canadian Municipal System 41

Notes and Questions 43

5. Council-City Commissioner System 45

Plunkett, Urban Canada and Its Government 45

6. Standing Committees 46

Jaffary and Makuch, Local Decision-Making 46

Note 46

7. Approaches to Reform 47

(i) The Basic Assumption - Policy v. Administration 47

Jaffary and Makuch, Local Decision-Making and Administration 47

Hickey, Decision-Making Processes in Ontario's Local Governments 51

(ii) Three Examples of Reform 57

(a) Winnipeg 57

Proposal for Urban Reorganization in the Greater Winnipeg Area 57

Note 60

Cook & Feldman, Approaches to Local Government Reform in Canada: The Case of Winnipeg 61

(b) Administrative Districts 63

Jacobs, The Death and Life of Great American Cities 63

(c) Toronto 65

City of Toronto Neighbourhood Services Work Group, Report 65

B. The Reorganization of Municipalities 69

1. The Need for Reform 69

Advisory Committee on Intergovernmental Relations, In Search of Balance: Canada's Intergovernmental Experience 69

Advisory Committee on Intergovernmental Relations, Alternative Approaches to Governmental Reorganization in Metropolitan Areas 71

2. Distribution of Responsibilities 76

(i) The Metropolitan Toronto Example 76

(ii) Regional Government 77

The Ontario Committee on Taxation, Report: Volume II - The Local Revenue System 77

Notes 84

3. The Problems With Reorganization 84

(i) Boundaries 84

Robarts, Report of the Royal Commission on Metropolitan Toronto 85

(ii) Special Purpose Bodies 86

Bureau of Municipal Research, "The 101 Governments of Metro Toronto" 86

Jaffary and Makuch, Local Decision-Making and Administration 95

Note 96

(iii) Representation 96

Jaffary and Makuch, Local Decision-Making and Administration 96

(iv) Intra Regional Conflict 102

Simpson, City Loses Important Votes at First Meeting of Metro Council 102

Globe & Mail, City Decides on Legal Fight over Spadina 102

Note 103

Globe & Mail, York Joins City in Opposing Spadina Paving 103

Note 105

Weinstein, "The Effect of the Federal Reapportionment Decisions on Municipal Government" 105

(v) An Alternative: The Winnipeg Experience 106

Committee of Review City of Winnipeg Act, Report and Reccomendations 106

Globe & Mail, Assessing the Plan to Reform Winnipeg's Government 113

CHAPTER III

LOCAL GOVERNMENT FINANCING

Introduction 120

A. Introduction 121

1. Municipal Finance Generally 121

Plunkett, The Financial Structure and the Decision-Making Process of Canadian Municipal Government 121

Local Government Finance in Ontario (Ministries of Treasury and Economics & Intergovernmental Affairs) 121

2. The Property Tax 136

The Ontario Committee on Taxation, Report: Volume II - The Local Revenue System 136

Plunkett, The Financial Structure and the Decision-Making Process of Canadian Municipal Government 138

B. Restraints on Municipal Finance 140

1. Political Restraints 140

Plunkett, The Financial Structure and The Decision-Making Process of Canadian Municipal Government 140

Statement by Paul V. Godfrey, President Canadian Federation of Mayors and Municipalities 144

Notes 146

2. Legal Restraints 146

Re Corporation of the Township of Nepean 147

Jaffary and Makuch, Local Decision-Making and Administration 153

City of Toronto v. Municipality of Metropolitan Toronto 159

Re Victoria Harbour Sewage Service 162

Lewis v. Town of Prescott 167

Note 168

C. Property Tax Assessment 169

1. Who is Liable for Property Taxation 169

2. What is Assessable Property 169

Northern Broadcasting Co. Ltd. v. Improvement District of Mountjoy 170

Notes and Questions 173

3. Exemptions from Taxation 174

Makuch, Municipal and Planning Law 174

(i)	Crown Land	175
	Makuch, Municipal and Planning Law	175
	Notes	177
(ii)	Indian Lands	177
(ii)	Indian Lands	177
(iii)	Places of Worship and Cemetaries	177
	Re Presbyterian Church Building Corp. and Assessment Comm. for Algoma	177
	Re Singh and City of Sudbury	181
	Notes	186
(iv)	Public Education Institutions, Philanthropic or Religious Seminaries and Educational Seminaries	187
	Re McMaster University and City of Hamilton et al.	187
	Notes	190
	Donald Piazezza Beauty Salon et al. v. Corporation of the Borough of North York	191
	Note	193
	Seafarers Training Institute v. Township of Williamsburg	194
	Notes	198
(v)	Public Hospitals, Highways, Municipal Property, Boy Scouts and Girl Guides and Industrial Farms	199
(vi)	Municipal Properties	199
	Makuch, Municipal and Planning Law	199

	Notes	200
(vii)	Charitable Institutions	201
	Makuch, Municipal and Planning Law	201
	Notes	202
(viii)	Children's Aid Societies, Scientific or Literary Institutions and Battle Sites	203
(ix)	Machinery and Equipment Used for Manufacturing or Farming Purposes	203
	Notes	203
(x)	The Interpretation of "Property Of"	204
	Makuch, Municipal and Planning Law	204
(xi)	Exceptions to Certain Exemptions and Municipal Exemptions	205
	Makuch, Municipal and Planning Law	205
(xii)	Bonuses	207
	Re Whitton and City of Ottawa	207
	Note	208
4.	Valuation of Property	209
(i)	Market Value	209
	Ward, Market Value Re-Assessment	209
	Montreal v. Sun Life Assurance Co. of Canada	216
	Assessment Commissioner of the York Assessment Office v. Office Speciality Ltd.	227
	Carreiro et al v. Regional Assessment Commissioner, Region no. 9	229
	Notes	231
(ii)	Equity	232

(a) Introduction 232

Joint Committee on Property Tax Reform Interim Report: The Present Property Tax System 232

Note 234

(b) Section 65 235

Foxhead Inn Ltd. v. Regional Assessment Commissioner 235

Regal Stationary Co. Ltd. v. Regional Assessment Commissioner, Region No. 11 236

Downtown Oshawa Property Owners' Association, Hovell Holdings Limited and Drew Estate v. Regional Assessment Commissioner, Region Number 13, The Corporation of the City of Ottawa 237

Notes 240

Regional Assessment Commissioners Region No. 2 et al. v. Ontario Steel Products Co. Ltd. 241

Notes 244

(c) Section 63 244

Campeau v. Regional Assessment Commissioner, Region No. 29 244

(iii) Special Provision for Farm Land 245

(iv) Special Provisions for Reforested Lands, Wood Lands and Orchards 246

(v) Special Provisions for Golf Courses 246

(vi) Other Special Provisions 246

5. Business Assessment 247

(i) Liability for Business Assessment - Carrying on a Business 247

Regional Assessment Commissioner v. Caisse Populaire de Hearst Ltée 247

Notes and Questions 251

Re Saga Canadian Management Services Ltd. and City of Ottawa et al. 252

Notes 257

(ii) Rate of Business Assessment 258

Re Regional Assessment Commissioner, Region No. 18 and Hudson's Bay Co. 258

Notes and Question 264

6. Appeals 265

Downtown Churchworkers Association of the Anglican Church of Canada and Dioceses of Toronto v. Regional Assessment Commissioner, Region No. 7 et al. 266

D. Local Improvements and Special Assessment 272

E. Reform 273

Financing Development of Local Government in Ontario 273

Notes and Questions 274

Report of the Royal Commission on Metropolitan Toronto 275

CHAPTER IV

JUDICIAL REVIEW OF MUNICIPAL ACTION

Introduction 294

A. Constitutionality 297

(i) Distribution of Powers 297

Notes and Questions 301

(ii) The Charter of Rights and Freedoms 301

McCutcheon v. City of Toronto 301

Canada (Eve) Studio v. Winnipeg 303
Blanchfield v. Corp. City of Ottawa 306
Notes 306
Tushnet, Ely and Constitutional Theory 307
Tribe, Process Based Theories 307

B. Express Authority 308

Ottawa Electric Light Co. v. Corporation of Ottawa 308
Note 309
Morrison v. Kingston 310
Re Pride Cleaners and Dyers 312
Re Christie Tax Ltd and Doran 315
Notes 316
Re Reional Municipality of Ottawa-Carleton and Voyageur Colonial Ltd. et al 317
Re Weir et al and the Queen 320
Notes and Questions 321
Report of the Royal Commission on Metropolitan Toronto 324

C. Delegation 326

(i) To Employees 326
Russell v. The Corporation of Toronto 326
R. v. Sandler 327
R. v. Campbell 330
(ii) To Council Committees 331
Simon v. Gastonguay et al. 331
(iii) To the Community 334
R. v. Sepanary 334
Re Davies and Village of Forest Hill 335

(iv) Reform 338

Report of the Royal Commission on Metropolitan Toronto 338

D. Discrimination 339

(i) Subclassification 339

Re Bunce and Town of Coburg 339

R. v. Donald B. Allen Ltd. 341

City of Ottawa v. Royal Trust Co. 342

City of Montreal v. Arcade Amusements 345

(ii) Permits and Licences 359

City of Verdun v. Sun Oil Co. Ltd. 359

(iii) Administrative Action 362

Atkinson v. Municipality of Metropolitan Toronto 362

E. Fettering 364

Galt Canadian Woodworking Machinery v. City of Galt 364

F. The Impact of Provincial Policy 365

Re Regional Municipality of Ottawa Carleton and Township of Marlborough 365

R. v. Morin 368

A.G. for Ontario v. City of Mississauga 371

G. Vagueness 386

City of Montreal v. Arcade Amusements 386

Re Information Retailers Assoc. of Metropolitan Toronto and Municipality of Metropolitan Toronto 390

Notes 392

H.	Unreasonableness	393
	Kruse v. Johnson	393
	Note	394
I.	Bad Faith	395
	Re Howard and City of Toronto	395
	Kuchma v. Rural Municipality of Tache	398
	Canada (Eve Studio) v. Winnipeg	400
J.	Geographic Limitations	404
	R. v. Roy	404
	Notes	409
K.	Technical Requirements	410
	Re Whitton and City of Ottawa	410